How to be universal

Ginger, Andrew

DOI:
10.7765/9781526124753.00007

Document Version
Peer reviewed version

Citation for published version (Harvard):
Ginger, A 2018, How to be universal. in A Ginger & G Lawless (eds), *Spain in the nineteenth century: New essays on experiences of culture and society.* Interventions: Rethinking the Nineteenth Century, Manchester University Press, pp. 38-62. https://doi.org/10.7765/9781526124753.00007

[From: Ed Ginger & Lawless, *Spain in the nineteenth century: Essays on experiences of culture and society*, MUP 2018]

Chapter 2: How to be universal

Andrew Ginger

The U-word

Universal was, for a time, a dirty word in many quarters of cultural study. Michel Foucault foretold that nineteenth-century Europe's notion of universal humanity - its face of man - would be wiped from the sands of time.[1] Homi Bhabha criticized even the claim that Europe projected a universalizing, homogenizing modernity: this was, in some respects, a self-serving, self-deceiving myth.[2] The universal is suspect: it may be a cover story for local interests, a projected self-image of those who hold power, a thin veil for prejudice, or just a means to crush what makes others different.[3] The lively critic is tasked with its unmasking. Thus, if the great nineteenth-century Spanish Museum, the Prado, lays claims to universality, then Spanish cultural studies reveals the bourgeois male preferences lurking behind its facade.[4] Antonio Monegal contemplates the field of Spanish literature, and spies claims to universal literary value beneath it, crowding out difference.[5] The title of Bhabha's famous work – *The Location of Culture* – speaks volumes about the mistrust of universality. The universal seems not just opposed to what is situated in a place and time – of which Bhabha provides a nuanced, critical, and qualified account; it appears to lie beyond any attempt, however sophisticated, to frame the study of culture in relation to locations.

In recent years, some cultural theorists have given certain kinds of universality a more favourable press. But they tend to write either in a broad Marxist or Radical Left Hegelian

tradition (Badiou, Žižek). Žižek's kind of universalism has found support in some areas of Spanish studies, for example in David Vilasecas's *Hindsight and the Real*. Postcolonial perspectives in Latin American cultural studies offer a highly attenuated, nuanced alternative, what Mignolo calls 'diversity as a universal project'. Almost by definition, such approaches do few favours to and overtly reject many strains of nineteenth-century universalism.[6] More accommodating revisions of universalist outlooks may be found elsewhere. Critics such as Donald Wehrs and David Haney read a broad range of nineteenth-century literature in relation to one of its descendants, the French ethical philosopher Levinas and his universal ethics.[7] Yet, even this approach risks framing the debate in a constrictive and, in some ways, familiar fashion. Once again disavowing bad kinds of 'totalizations' – that is, attempts to present a systematic account of everything – Levinasian ethics finds universality in recognizing how radically different one person is from any other. This is 'totalization as unfinished process', in the words of Bradley Stephens' powerful revaluation of Victor Hugo's work.[8] Its intellectual merits or demerits aside,[9] and even allowing for the fresh vistas it opens onto the 1800s, the Levinasian viewpoint is obviously at odds with much of the nineteenth-century mainstream, so often given to system building and generality.

Truth to tell, so far as nineteenth-century Spanish culture goes, one has only to trawl the indexes of recent monographs to discover how infrequent is sustained, constructive discussion of universality. The tale told of nineteenth-century Spanish history and culture has usually been one of nation-building and its discontents.[10] There have been some ventures into transnational phenomena, such as Elisa Martí-López's *Borrowed Words*,[11] but few into the universal as a topic in itself. As a result of these combined factors – a widespread hostility and a specific neglect – we risk assuming a familiarity with nineteenth-century Spanish universalism that we do not actually have. In saying all this, I do not mean lightly to dismiss the all-too-obvious oppressions wrought in the name of universality by nineteenth-century

Europeans, including Spaniards. But I do mean, both to bring the topic of universality more fully back into view, and to proceed with care in exploring the Spanish take on it. Some of the most illuminating recent work on the nineteenth century, such as that of Susan Manning on the English-speaking world, sets established terms of debate somewhat to one side. In so doing, critics like Manning recover unexpected insights from half-forgotten ways of thinking, and with them a language in which to address problems of our own.[12] Some writers, notably Martha Nussbaum, have looked to the broader history of universalism and of notions of global citizenship to find the potential within them to address pressing current dilemmas and impasses. Writing of ancient Stoic thought, Nussbaum remarks on how its very notion of global humanity underwrote both its critical outlook and its respect for valuable local bonds: 'Only a human identity that transcends these divisions shows us why we should look at one another with respect across them'.[13] Taking a broader view still in *The Undivided Past* (2013) – a long perspective on the history of human societies and of how that history has been written – David Cannadine comments, 'To write about the past no less than to live in the present, we need to see beyond our difference […] to embrace and to celebrate the common humanity that has always bound us together'.[14] It is not necessary ultimately to adhere to the specific arguments put by, for example, Nussbaum or Cannadine, to appreciate from their writings that many historic notions of the *universal* may merit at least a hearing.

In a century supposedly so given to Spanish nation-building, one of the intellectual towers was Julián Sanz del Río's book *Ideal de la humanidad para la vida* (*Ideal of humanity for life*) (1860). Every scholar of the country knows this, and yet the basic fact – that the work concerns humankind as a whole – attracts surprisingly little sensitive attention in and of itself.[15] Sanz del Río describes all humanity as a single, organic society. His central point is that there is a 'fin humano antes que fin nacional o particular' (human purpose prior to any national or particular purpose).[16] There are many such telling historical realities. For example,

school children habitually studied Universal History, and there were vast numbers of textbooks published on the subject: a quick search of the Spanish National Library throws up scores of items on *historia universal* spawned between 1800 and 1899. Nineteenth-century universalism was a massive phenomenon in Spain, and, at the very least, requires something more than clichéd and caricatured attention if we are to understand the historical period.Universalism in Spanish territories ranged from expressions of brutal racism through to calls for revolutionary federalism, for Phillipine nationalism, or for the emancipation of women. For all the flaws in many versions of nineteenth-century universality, our casual dismissal of it may deprive us of some rich insights. Given that its oppressive dimensions are by now extremely well documented, this chapter will mainly focus on what might be called its *historical remainder*: what is left above and beyond the most obvious cruelties wrought in its name. The chapter will consider how aspects of this 'remainder' may lead us to question blanket assumptions about the homogenizing intent of nineteenth-century universalism.

Why be universal?

Subjects of the Spanish government in the nineteenth century had two primary, overlapping, but not identical motives for wishing to be universal. The first arose from the state's present situation and longer history. Spain had been a large world monarchy into the opening years of the century; now it was much reduced following the independence of almost all of the Americas. Many Spanish commentators felt acutely the need to secure their country's standing in the world, and with it the urge for recognition for Spain's historic role in the shaping of the globe. There was a sense of loss, a wish to be noticed, and a desire to participate. In the prospect to its very first issue, in 1857, the widely read, and strikingly named, journal *Museo Universal* (Universal museum), gave powerful voice to such sentiments. All talents throughout place and time, it said, serve the 'gran obra de universal

organización' (great work of universal organization). The Spanish publication hoped to lend its own weight to the effort, but noted that Spain's vast part in the history of human civilization was little noticed elsewhere following its decline. The journal's contribution to the great task of universal organization would include an effort to 'apreciar y hacer apreciar lo que España fue, y lo que será algún dia' (appreciate and make people appreciate what Spain was, and what it will one day be).[17] At the same time, the rump Spanish state in Iberia and in its scattered overseas possessions was made up of disparate former kingdoms and powerful local loyalties. A notion of universality could provide a common framework for articulating how these pieces fitted together, and with the world beyond. Gazing back in 1877 on the troubles of Spain's long history and of its recent past, the Federalist politician and thinker Francisco Pi i Margall remarked that, 'Reinos que fueron por mucho tiempo independientes y se unieron bajo la condición de que se les respetase su autonomía, es natural que tiendan siempre que puedan a recobrarla' (It is natural that kingdoms that were for a long time independent and that united with each other on the condition that their autonomy was respected always tend to seek to recover that autonomy).[18] His remedy was to seek a new understanding of the notion of *unity* itself and, by the same token, of a united humanity: 'La unidad, lo repito, está en la existencia de unos mismos poderes para cada orden de intereses, no en la absorción de todos los intereses por un solo poder. Así como partiendo de esta idea se puede sin violencia llegar a recoger en un haz la humanidad entera' (Unity, I repeat, lies in their being the same set of powers for each order of interests, not in the absorption of all interests by a single power. So it is that, taking this idea as a starting point, one can manage without violence to gather the whole of humanity in one sheaf).[19] The leading Philippine politician, Pedro Alejandro Paterno, writing his *La familia tagálog en la historia universal* (*The Tagalog family in universal history*) (1892), sought to defend his country's dignity precisely by showing it traverse the paths taken by all humanity.[20] The notion of universality

could, thus, open up a space for marginalized or fallen polities to act on an even plane with hegemonic powers, or at least for fantasizing about so doing. It was a potential corrective to imbalances of force in the world. In 1875, for example, the mathematician Vicente Puyals de la Bastida repeated his longstanding advocacy of a number system with 12 as its base. The matter, the title of his latest book announced, was of 'universal importance'. Puyals de la Bastida claimed that his discovery was an eternal truth about numerals and would be welcomed with joy by all peoples. The system would free them from the dominant decimal system, emanating from France, which only force had successfully imposed upon them.[21] The very fact of Great Power hegemony in the affairs of the world was, then, a stimulus to universalism in less potent regions. Rather than being just a colonial or neo-colonial imposition, the aspiration to universality could take the form of a counterweight, a counter-attack even. Amartya Sen offers a recent version of this approach in his influential book, *The Idea of Justice* (2009). Sen admires the thoughts of the Western Enlightenment, and powerfully argues that very similar 'ideas of justice […] have been pursued in many different parts of the world'. He therefore seeks to rescue such contributions from having been 'overlooked or marginalized'.[22]

The second motive for universalism was a genuine concern with matters general to humanity. These accounted for a great deal of lived experience. There were allegiances to supranational movements, belief systems, and institutions that claimed universal relevance. Such things were major factors in life in Spanish territories, from religion through to politics. A teacher in Cuba, Nicolás María Serrano y Díez wrote in a textbook of 1885 that only the Catholic Church showed us the true unity of humanity, and that 'la doctrina de la redención de todos los hombres con la misma sangre del Hombre-Dios, es la causa principal de la civilización del mundo y de la más completa y universal que esperamos en lo futuro' (the doctrine of the redemption of all men by the very same blood of the Man-God is the principal

cause of world civilization and of the more complete and universal civilization that we await in the future).[23] Writing for Spanish university students, Juan Ortega y Rubio claimed that his compendium of universal history would serve the 'gran familia humana' (great human family) in the love of justice, liberty, and progress.[24] And there were important activities and areas of enquiry that, in the broadest terms, were manifestly shared by all or nearly all human societies: transport, housing, counting, treating the sick, for example. Following the collapse of the ancien régime and much of the old empire, Spanish government and civil society dedicated much energy to such matters.[25] Thus, two highly influential doctors, Francisco Méndez Álvaro and Matías Nieto Serrano, launched the publication in 1847 of a multi-volume *Prontuario universal de ciencias médicas* (*Universal guide to medical sciences*) to help students shine in their medical exams.[26] In 1867, the urban planner, Ildefonso Cerdá, preparing the ground for his transformation of Barcelona, began by tracing a theory of all human habitation. Dwelling, he claimed, was more universal even than clothing: humanity owes all that it is to the construction of housing.[27]

There was considerable overlap between the two sets of motives that I have outlined. The activities of all humanity formed a stage on which Spaniards and Spain could demonstrate their universal significance. This was – and is – one of the attractions of statistical measurement, as exemplified in Pascual Madoz's seminal geographical-statistical-historical dictionary (1843, revised 1846). Madoz claims that statistics came about so states could assess by common measure who was superior without having recourse to war.[28] Likewise, notable contributions to supranational institutions and movements were a source of long-established, chivalric values: honour and glory. The prologue to the liberal nationalist constitution of 1812 assures us that 'Leyes humanas, sí, muy humanas y filosóficas aparecen en nuestros códigos para gloria de sus autores, honra y loor de la Nación entera' (Humane laws, yes, very humane and thoughtful laws appear in our legal codes to the glory of their

authors, and to the honour and praise of the whole Nation). The measure of that is what the prologue terms the history of all human societies.[29] One of the giants of nineteenth-century Spanish medicine, Pedro Mata, urges his fellow doctors to strive so as to join the great names in humanity's progress. In so doing, he depicts himself in 1859 as the first knight to enter the joust.[30] That other nations could build fine bridges, lay out roads, dissect a brain, or make a well-formed law was a spur to showing that Spanish subjects could do the same. Pedro Alejandro Paterno presented Tagalog divorce law as a model for the most civilized nations of Europe.[31] Narcisco Monturiol, the inventor of the submarine *El Ictíneo*, announced in 1860 that a new hour had struck: humanity would take possession now of the underwater world, and, as it did so, Spaniards would rise above the pride of other nations, showing their equal worth. Echoing Spain's earlier, and now largely abandoned, imperial ventures in the Americas, Monturiol spoke of a great conquest in a new world.[32]

What is at stake here is not just what aspirations to universality *are* or *mean*. Rather, it also matters what they *do*, what effect they have. Of course, to say that some exemplar of Spanish literature or art is of universal importance implies beliefs - right or wrong - about what is of value to all humanity. But it is also an action, a staking out of a place in the sun. For this reason, Spanish universalism often takes shape in pedagogy, didacticism, or practical endeavor. Spaniards are concerned with learning, teaching, and showing how to be universal. Frequently, practical difficulties and immediate societal challenges are the stimulus for universalist utterances. It would be quite wrong to deduce from this that nineteenth-century Spanish subjects had no taste for universal metaphysics. On the contrary, some shared that preoccupation with contemporaries elsewhere. It is simply that their interest in abstractions was often practical in origin and had a view to conclusions that would be practical in application. So, when the philosopher Miguel de Unamuno wrote the often speculative *En torno al casticismo* (*About Traditionalism*) (1895), he took as its start and end point the

raging, daily, public debate about foreign culture invading Spain and the need to renew social and political activity in the country.[33]

Particularity, multiplicity, and universality

These outlines already contradict many later caricatures of the *universal*. Much cultural criticism directed at nineteenth-century thinking supposes particularity and universality to be quite distinct things. In fact, the *universal* was explicitly understood as the involvement, activity, and participation of particular groups and agents. It has this at least in common with what Kwame Anthony Appiah describes in his book *The Ethics of Identity* (2005) as a 'form of universalism that is sensitive to the ways in which historical context may shape the significance of a practice'.[34] In the territories of Spain, riven internally to the point of cantonalism, and begging externally at the Great Powers' feast, prophets arose who took flight on this current of thought. Seeking to resolve Spain's recurrent crises, the Federalist Pi i Margall detached the notion of *nationality* from the forms it habitually took in the nineteenth century: appeals to communities based on common language, or so-called natural frontiers, or supposed shared history, or racial identity. These he viewed as historically false, or, at the very least, absurd in their consequences. For example, on linguistic grounds, one could deduce that, while the Basque Country should be given independence, Spanish America ought once more to be part of Spain. Instead, Pi advocated a shared human framework for identity and nationality, based on the autonomy of every identifiable level of human activity from the municipality upwards. The foundation stone would be the concrete reality of day-to-day shared life in communities, so palpable and real, not some vague appeal to ontology.[35]

The broader yearning for forms of participation that would truly incorporate diversity gave rise to aspirational, anti-discriminatory forms of universalism. A case in point is the famous article series 'La Mujer' ('Woman') (1860) by the female Cuban writer Gertrudis

Gómez de Avellaneda.[36] In these essays, Gómez de Avellaneda frankly addressed a social and cultural reality: pejorative consideration of and obstacles to women's authority in matters of government, religion, patriotism, and the arts and sciences, on the grounds of biological difference.[37] Most strikingly, from the perspective of universalism and its history, Gómez de Avellaneda shows how to construe a form of (supposedly) clear particularity (women's capacity for sentiment, 'sentimiento') as the very grounds of sameness: identical involvement in all aspects of human life. If, she argues, 'great intellectual power' required not just reasoning but the 'poder del corazón' (power of the heart), women's sentiment would be the basis of success in vast areas of human activity, including those from which they were habitually excluded. This is true of the whole of the 'anales de la humanidad' (anales de la humanidad) (293). Within Catholicism, the gendered affective force of the maternal Virgin Mary and of the redeemed sexual sinner Mary Magdalen were together the very synthesis of woman (290), and, by extension, the basis upon which women could take the lead in all human affairs, including 'toda la autoridad civil y política' (toda la autoridad civil y política) (299). If we put the implications of 'La Mujer' at their starkest, Avellaneda is asserting that difference is not something utterly distinct from universality, but rather that the one may seamlessly dilate into the other. In turn, Avellandeda celebrates Spain's national heroines patriotically amid a myriad of beloved examples from elsewhere across place and time. Spain will take its place in the history of the world, not primarily through what separates it from the rest, but through its expansive expression of femininity, and thence of universally shared human virtue. Avellandeda's section on government and politics pointedly begins its culmination with the words 'deteneos algunos minutos contemplando con legítimo orgulllo nacional la magnífica figura de Isabel la Católica' (dwell some minutes as you contemplated with legitimate national pride the magnificent figure of Isabel the Catholic) (300).

Such engagement with specific realities and with difference belies the notion that

universality was simply monolithic or flattening - that is, that it always and solely ignored or suppressed real inequalities or variations. There were a range of different universalities for diverse and distinct ends; this is something Melba Cuddy-Keane and her collaborators have similarly noted in their study of keywords in Modernism.[38] There were, for example, universal units of measurement derived from the nature of numbers, universal medical diagnoses deduced from biology or phenomenology, universal behavioural tendencies noted in anthropology and history. It is an implicit assumption of nineteenth-century activity and thought that these several universals co-exist and complement one another. Some people, like Sanz del Río in his *Ideal de la humanidad para la vida*,[39] tried to unify them all in a grand synthesis. But many, practically speaking, did not, and even the notion of a synthesis was often highly nuanced. The secretary of the Royal Academy of Medicine, Matías Nieto y Serrano, warned in 1860 that no synthesis of knowledge could ever produce, create, or delimit the parts of which it was composed in the absence of the particular, independent endeavors that made up those parts.[40] Multiplicity is manifest elsewhere too in universalism. To say that a specific group – such as a nation – had contributed something universal to humanity, was precisely not to say that the vision or innovation exhausted all human possibility nor that other cultures might not offer up different universal insights. In *En torno al casticismo* – whose poetics I will examine at length at the end of this chapter - Unamuno explores how the rise and fall of Imperial Spain resonated as eternal truth in the death of Don Quixote. Don Alonso Quijano's return to sanity marks an end to Castile's untrammelled willfulness, its oppressive imperial intent, while recognizing all that is good in such unhindered longing (LXXVII.v). This is one gift to the world, one recognition of something deeply human. Italy's Dante offers something else: a sensual cult of the heart wed to ancient wisdom (LXXVII.iii). Unamuno calls such insights the sediment of eternal truths from the rivers of humanity (LXXIV.iii).

In some spheres of activity, the *universal* itself was presented as one way of looking at the world alongside others, rather than as an outlook that subsumed everything else. Like many other historians throughout the century, Alfonso Moreno Espinosa taught in 1871 that history could be viewed in a range of different ways. Universal history is one of these; but so are general and particular history.[41] Ortega y Rubio listed many more – including municipal history, biographical history, history of science, history of art, and so forth – varying according to the subject and object of the particular study.[42] Again, the deciding factor was the purpose and objective served by adopting one or other perspective.

Choice, judgment, and selection

Choice and judgment are central to exercising such preferences. They are equally fundamental to many versions of the universal laws said to govern human society. *Universal law* in this context often meant the fundamental nature and conditions of making a choice. Thus, Ortega y Rubio argued that the absolute principle of all human history was that an agent/subject existed in relation to space, time, and movement.[43] Laws of this kind did not determine the outcome of human decisions: the door was open to plural possible outcomes. The universal was neither straightforwardly identical to the 'given' – something predetermined and unchanging – nor was it just the result of a free choice. Often it took shape as a second nature, by which I mean a reasonable or predictable human practice in light of needs, circumstances, and physical laws. Thus, in writing of shorthand and its universal history in 1879, Pedro Garriga Marill observed that 'El hombre va desplegando los recursos de su inventiva, a medida que la necesidad le acosa y obliga. Al idear la escritura ordinaria para detener y conservar la palabra fugitiva, sintió además la necesidad de que ambas dos, palabra y escritura, corriesen paralelamente, y entonces debía de arbitrar, y en efecto, arbitró, la Taquigrafía' (Man proceeds to unfurl the resources of his inventiveness in tandem with

necessity pressuring and obliging him so to do. Once he had thought up ordinary forms of writing so as to keep hold of and preserve the fleeting word, he felt the need too for both, word and writing, to run in parallel, and then he must have hit upon, indeed he did hit upon, shorthand). This Garriga Marill called a natural necessity.[44] The vast universal mythology produced by Juan Bautista Carrasco (1865) shows how such needs could at once be universally shared and produce distinct contingent outcomes. So, for example, all human beings break time up into units for practical purpose, but the way they do so varies vastly from culture to culture. Bautista Carrasco delights in exhibiting the many different such systems that societies have produced.[45] Even when people invoked a law of progress, as the *Museo Universal* did in its opening issue, they often meant only that human interactions and actions over centuries would, on balance, lead to betterment – a not unreasonable gamble. The element of contingency involved is evident: the journal acknowledges fateful falls and cruel disappointments in history, and it makes clear that progress can only be made if talented human beings choose to contribute: 'esta germinación, como lenta, necesita de poderosos auxiliares' (that germination, being slow, requires powerful assistance).[46] Success and failure, after all, had both been Spain's fate over time, as the *Museo Universal*'s prospect recalled. So, universality entailed both judgments about what choices might be made, as well as assessments of what human beings would most likely do.

Selectivity went hand in hand with this. Universality involved opting for one decision over another, or attending to one thing rather than to something else. In many areas of activity, *universality* implied neither inclusiveness nor exhaustive coverage. In the same spirit as many other writers, Alfonso Moreno Espinosa tells us that universal history deals only with the things that interest all humanity.[47] Because of its evaluative character – and not because it was by definition monolithic or self-deceiving – the universal could very easily become the servant of prejudice and exclusion. It was all too casually equated with things

European, as it often was by Unamuno. At best, this was due to deep ignorance and wild error. At worst – and all too often – the cause was primitive hostility to those who seemed different, and an equally primitive sense of one's own superiority. Disgracefully, Ortega y Rubio claimed that only white people truly had a history.[48] On the one hand, we can recognize here the historic, and by now amply documented, negative effects of some nineteenth-century universalism. On the other, we may note that the pursuit of universality, by its very nature, rested on the assumption of risk for good and ill, precisely because it entailed evaluation. Likewise, risk was constitutive of universality. So therefore were ethical responsibility, sensibility, and accountability. As the Catholic writer Mariano Laita y Moya put it in 1887, universal history can give us no (ethical) judgments if human beings are not responsible for and assessed according to their own actions.[49]

These thoughts retain significant creative potential. Universalism supposed that human beings absolutely need to make judgments, to select, and to prioritize. Moreover, evaluations of human conduct and achievements were seen - at least potentially - as statements of fact about the world. Neither of these suppositions is straightforwardly implausible. For example, the philosopher Hilary Putnam remarks in *The Collapse of the Fact/Value Dichotomy and Other Essays* (2002) that

> the judgment that a particular person is kind or cruel, that a person is impertinent or refreshingly spontaneous, or that a child is 'having problems' or 'discovering her identity' – there are endlessly many examples and endlessly many *sorts* of example – are all judgements of value in the sense under discussion. I maintain that such judgements are in practice regarded as true or false and *should* so be regarded.[50]

This kind of standpoint – and the use of selectivity and evaluation – were important not least

as a means to highlight what really mattered about an otherwise marginalized culture and society, that of Spain. When, in *En torno al casticismo*, Unamuno urges that Spain is still to be discovered (LXXVIII), when he says that to know oneself one must know one's own history (LXXV), he means that we are capable of discerning and apprehending in a given culture its universal significance, and of doing so without the quixotic requirement to compare it to every other culture. In so doing, he suggests, we can indeed differentiate things of universal quality from those of lesser value: for example, we may evaluate as of positive universal significance the poet and thinker Fray Luis de León and yet object to the Inquisition. Such a path steers clear of a subjective relativism that makes nothing more worthwhile than anything else, that truly does flatten out all human activity.

Mutation and metamorphosis

Selectivity endowed universality with a shape-shifting quality, with an inherent mutability. This is most obviously visible in atlases of universal history, such as the one published by Juan de la G. Artero in 1896. Images of one particular place and time come to the fore, then to be supplanted in successive pages by others, according to their significance in the development of the world. Now India is seen in the Age of the Arians, now we switch to Labrador in the Norman explorations; now we view Africa but see only the Phoenician lands in detail; now eleventh-century Europe appears with Iberia slipping out of sight.[51] The practical and pedagogical aims of universalism reinforce the effect as authors factor in the needs and abilities of their readership. In elementary textbooks, universal history broke into staccato successions of questions and answers. The sequence was dictated by the author's assessment of what constitutes core knowledge. Teodoró Baró's 1880 history course has a question and answer about Napoleon's exile before one about the War of the Spanish Succession, one about Felipe V's abdication before others about the substance of his reign; it

jumps from Felipe V's punishment of the Catalans to the institution of the Salic Law.[52] The primacy of value judgments took precedence even over chronological order. In the most subtle instances, chronology is not quite kept to, or is revisited from multiple simultaneous angles. In his basic history course of 1871, Juan Casañ y Alegre favoured tracing the rise and fall of each people in turn, feeling this was more easily memorized.[53] More dramatically, chronology's status could be explicitly ambiguous, not least in the most overtly Catholic publications. There all history is seen from the fixed vantage point of Christ's death and resurrection in the first century. Serrano y Díez remarks that Calvary is the culminating point of history, and that from the summit of that bloody mountain one can observe all the great events of humanity around about.[54] On occasion, authors found universality in patterns of comparison and analogy that traversed boundaries of place and time. This is the case in Paterno's account of the Tagalog family in universal history. Habitually, an observation about a specific context (the Philippines, late nineteenth century) opens out into long series of sentences and paragraphs, meandering through geography and history, juxtaposing countries and eras, held together by similarity and variation, before returning once more to the initial focus. Considering dowry customs, for example, he starts in the Philippines and ventures out across his paragraphs into modern Spain, ancient Egypt, and medieval Scandinavia.[55]

Science reinforced the equation between the universal and metamorphosis. In some eyes, all Natural History was governed by its own patterns of similitude and variation, and formed an art work whose unity consisted in its endless transformations. Rafael García y Álvarez, a distinguished teacher in Granada, told his readers in 1867 that 'La teoría de los análogos y homólogos ha dado lugar también a la de la *unidad de composición*, no sólo de los diferentes animales, sino de los distintos órganos de cada uno de ellos, conduciendo algunos naturalistas a la de la trasformación y variabilidad de las especies' (The theory of analogies and homologies has in turn given rise to that of the *unity of composition*, not only of different

animals, but of the various organs of each one of them, leading some naturalists to the theory of the transformation and variability of species).[56] With the discoveries of organic chemistry, the entire material universe could be imagined this way. Vividly in 1870, two authors, Enrique Serrano and Salvador Calderón, described the whole of the universe and all life as a painting in which everything resembled all else, such that each part was the centre point for every other: 'eslabones relativamente semejantes del gran cuadro en que todo es centro respecto de lo más accesorio y accidental con relación a lo más elevado' (relatively similar links in the great picture in which everything is a centre with respect to what is most secondary and accidental in relation to what is most elevated).[57]

Universality as poetry

In the eyes of many, to be universal was to mutate across place and time, to shift through analogy, to bring fragmented visions in and out of view, to take shape around value and sensibility. By extension, the *universal* was, at times, conceived as poetry. We can see this in *El drama universal* (*The universal drama*) (1853), an epic in verse by the then celebrated poet Ramón de Campoamor. Disconcertingly, what is offered as a universal epic appears at first to be a love story that is confined in place and time – a particular context – and limited by mortality – a time period. Honorio longs for the devout Soledad, who is promised to his brother Palanciano; when the latter does not return because he has been imprisoned, Soledad takes to a nunnery where she dies after Honorio fails to seduce her; Honorio in turn, filled with sinful lust, kills himself. The vast poem seems to end abruptly, having hardly begun: fewer than 40 pages in, Campoamor informs us that 'Asi dio fin, tan triste y tan oscura, / Esta historia, de amor y ansias llena' (So came to an end so sad and so dark, this tale full of love and desires).[58] But from there the epic bursts out of chronological and geographical limits, under the watchful gaze and occasional intervention of Jesus the

Mage, the mysterious naked man of Mark 15:51-52, to whom is attributed a 'fantastical ubiquity' ('ubicuidad fantástica'), a capacity to range at will across all time (20). Honorio's specter roams tormented beyond his physical death, and at one stage takes over another mortal body only to die once more, returning again to ghosthood; Soledad is depicted in the Heavens; the protagonists wander allegorical planets of the afterlife where historical events are conjured up; they visit the time of Christ's death and head on to the Last Judgment.

Jesus the Mage shows us explicitly that poetry is the force bringing together the vast multiplicity of episodes in time and place to form a drama of universal meaning. Such is the cunning of the poetic connections, that their full significance is apparent only in retrospect as the story ends: Jesus the Mage there declaims, 'Mira el *por qué y el cómo embelesado, / Hacia ti y Soledad tendí mi vuelo; / Poema que, en tierra comenzado, / Acaba al fin,cantándose en el cielo'.* (Behold the *reason for and the manner in which, spellbound, I took flight towards you and Soledad; this Poem, begun on earth, ends up finally being sung in heaven*) (367). In saying this, he repeats words he had uttered early in the epic, completing a system of verbal echoes that runs through the work. Campoamor's appearance as the poet in the course of the poem itself, and his comments on how the tale resonates with his own feelings (71), underlines the point: to write poetry is to seek out universally significant connections, and vice-versa. To do so requires the imagination to travel beyond the constraints of any specific context, and out of the boundaries of any individual physical body. The entire structure of Campoamor's epic exemplifies poetry's capacity to achieve precisely that. But to journey beyond and out of these things is not just a matter of discarding them. The central trope of *El drama universal* is transmigration, transmutation. Honorio, dying, transforms into Soledad's gravestone from which he subsequently bursts forth; later, he will inhabit a soaring eagle and a young man. In a dramatic episode, he seeks to occupy the corpse of the Holy Roman Emperor and Spanish King Charles V, only to be violently rebuffed. At

this, all the body parts of the dead arise and chase around the continents of the globe, migrating across the confines of place and beyond those of their demise (52-61). In this domain of the poetic imagination and poetic language, opposites merge and fuse, liberated from their defining limits but not entirely alienated from what they were: 'La carne se iba en mármol confundiendo / Y algo de carne el mármol se volvía' (Flesh gradually blended into marble, and the marble turned to something of flesh) (38).

Above all, Campoamor depicts such transmigration as the effect of feeling: 'el sentimiento tiende a la metempsicosis' (sentiment tends to metempsychosis) (38). It is longing and desire that are expressed through poetry in the joining and unjoining of things, the seeping through and out of confines. Possession and dispossession, the owning or inhabiting of something other than ourselves, are what are at stake in universality. For this reason, in the poem, two rival universals mirror one another, and ultimately must join together. The one – depicted as Pagan, and linked to Pythagorean belief in transmigration (36) – consists in the wish to control and possess others according to one's desires whatever the obstacle: Honorio is the occupier, the colonizer of others, lustful when his affections are unrequited. He refuses to acknowledge rejection by Soledad and yearns for Charles V's 'universal poder' (universal power) (54) Within his transmigrations, what we see is his willfulness: Jesus the Mage, agreeing to obey his wishes, remarks 'Tu gusto, aun transmigrando, será el mío' (Even transmigrating, your wish will be mine) (86). This desire is both an urge to make unlimited connections, and a universal human torment shared by the poet himself: Honorio is always frustrated when he seeks to resolve his love for Soledad this way. The other universal – presented as Christian in origin – is a having and holding that is free of such frustration and oppression (355-56). This is what Soledad offers to Honorio at the end, reconciling him with herself and with Palanciano. But it is also to be seen in the very transmigration of the poem itself through its own episodes from beginning to providential

end. Both universals come together as the expression of the desires of specific persons and communities, as the manner in which a love triangle ultimately transforms into a kind of togetherness. The point of the transmigration of either sort is not the loss of the protagonists' particular personhood, but rather its expression and realization as universality. For the same reason, the 'universal drama' - as presented here to Spaniards - is more often than not focused on events and characters of importance to Spain from Charles V to Germán de Osorio to Queen Elizabeth I of England. Its longing for universality arises from, and is expressed through a particular community.

In poetic universality, an intimacy is effected between what would otherwise have a confined context in place and time, and what is free of all such limits. At the end of the century, in his *En torno al casticisimo* (1895), Unamuno undertook once more the task of realizing that marriage through poetics, of thereby finding Spain's contribution to, and capacity to participate in, universal humanity. Speaking of the protagonist of the *Quixote*, he exclaims: 'de puro español llegó á una como renuncia de su españolismo, llegó al espíritu universal, al hombre que duerme dentro de todos nosotros' (from being a pure Spaniard he came to something like a renunciation of his Spanishness, he came to the universal spirit, to the man who sleeps within us all) (LXXIV). Unamuno holds to no intellectual system or standpoint prior to his own quest for the universal. Rather, his writing transmigrates through *En torno* following what he calls 'ritmo' and 'ondulación' (rhythm and undulation) (LXXIV.ii), 'amontonar metáforas' [a piling up of metaphors) (LXXVIII.v), 'retórica' (rhetoric) (LXXIV, prologue), 'divagaciones deshilvanadas' (disjointed meanderings) (LXXVIII.vi).[59] In Alex Longhurst's phrase, Unamuno treats language as 'a protean and malleable material'.[60] In this way, the very words Unamuno uses are both drawn from specific contexts, and freed from them. Systems of thought – psychology, sociology, transcendental philosophy, biology, Christian theology – appear only as instances of this

rhythmic swaying, coming and going in the text.[61] Characteristically, at one point, Unamuno bookends a pile of mixed metaphors from disparate domains between an erudite reference to British psychology and an allusion to Father Angelo Secchi's view of physics:

> Los islotes que aparecen en la conciencia y se separan ó aproximan más, uniéndose á las veces, á medida que el nivel de ella baja ó sube, se enlazan allí, en el fondo del mar mental, en un suelo continuo. Son voces que surgen del rumor del coro, son las melodías de una sinfonía eterna. Figuraos astros rodeados de una extensa atmósfera etérea cada uno, que se acercan en sus movimientos orbitales, y fundiéndose sus atmósferas forman una sola que los envuelve y mantiene unidos y concertados, siendo la razón de su atracción mutua (LXXV.v).
>
> (The islets that appear in consciousness and move further apart or together, sometimes joining up, while the level of the latter falls or rises, intertwine there, in the depths of the mental sea, on a continuous stretch of ground. They are voices that surge up out of the sound of the chorus, they are melodies of an eternal symphony. Imagine stars, every one of them surrounded by an extensive ethereal atmosphere, which grow closer to each other in their orbital movements, and fusing their atmospheres form just one which envelopes them and keeps them in unity and concord, being the reason for their mutual attraction.)

Lurching about in this fashion, Unamuno seeks to buffet the reader through contradictions – the '*procedimiento rítmico de contradicciones*' (rhythmic process of contradictions), flipping his own arguments from side to side.[62] He tells us both that Castile is the true Spain, then that the country's diverse regionalism is making Castile truly Spanish (LXXV.i). In the second

essay, he explains Spanish sensibility on historical grounds, before starting again and doing so on the basis of geography. The outlook Unamuno engenders does not quite have sharp contours, just as it is not quite rooted to a context – it has the air of something defined by boundaries while at the same time not so being. He speaks of 'esta idea que flota en mi mente sin contornos definidos' (this idea floating in my mind without clear edges) (LXXVIII.v).

To write in this way is to conjure away three specters. The first is the notion that things are understood only when situated in a confined place and time. Unamuno mocks this 'pobre historia paleontológica' (poor paleontological history) (LXXVI.i). It fails to see what resonates beyond historical contexts, digging around instead for 'certificados históricos' (historical certificates) (LXXIV, prologue), as it does for the 'huesos que admiran los osteólogos y paleontólogos en los dramas sarmentosos de Calderón' (bones admired by osteologists and paleontologists in Calderón's gnarled plays) (LXXVI.i).[63] In its most reactionary form, it closes the doors of one place and time – modern day Spain – to the world beyond, screaming that it will lose its self (LXXIV.i). The second is the opposite: the irrelevance of places and times, the wish to do away with specific contexts, which Unamuno grotesquely evokes as a longing to be conquered (LXXIV.i). The third is the belief that, while there are entities bounded in their own contexts, they are also interconnected. Unamuno is critical of those who carve history into discrete sections and then attempt, contrariwise, to join those pieces up. He observes how the urge to re-connect time periods depends on, is unimaginable without, the obsession with separating them. Scathingly he comments on the efforts of politicians after the 1868 Revolution to make connections between Spain's present and past:

> Los que viven en el mundo, en la historia, atados al «presente momento histórico», peloteados por las olas en la superficie del mar donde se agitan naufragio [...] creen

> que puede interrumpirse y reanudarse la vida. Se ha hablado mucho de una reanudación de la historia de España (LXXIV.iii).
>
> (Those who live in the world, in history, tied to the 'present historical moment', tossed by the waves on the surface of the sea where shipwrecks are stirred […] believe that life can be interrupted and joined back up. People have spoken a great deal about joining Spain's history back up)

Unamuno wants us to attend instead to what does the journeying through place and time, what persists and endures, and how it does so. 'No reanudaron en realidad nada', he remarks, 'porque nada se había roto. Una ola no es otra agua que otra, es la misma ondulación que corre por el mismo mar' (In reality they joined nothing back up, for nothing had broken. A wave is not some other water than any other, it is the same undulation running through the same sea) (LXXIV.iii). This is what is truly classical, what a given history and location proffers to all humanity: 'hay un arte eterno y universal, un arte clásico, un arte sobrio en color local y temporal, un arte que sobrevivirá al olvido de los costumbristas todos. Es un arte que toma el ahora y el aquí como puntos de apoyo' (there is an eternal and universal art, a classical art, an art sober in its use of colour from its place and time, an art that will survive the oblivion awaiting those who describe customs and usages. It is an art that takes the now and here as its supports) (LXXIV.ii).

By extension, in its universalism, Unamuno's writing offers an alternative to three tendencies of our own time, broadly sketched: transnationalism; reception theory; and the injunction always to locate things in place and time, Fredric Jameson's influential war-cry: 'Always historicize!'[64] The latter requires no further explanation, and Unamuno would clearly reject it. Transnationalism - if the word is to mean anything at all and when it is not

employed laxly - signifies the existence of bounded nations whose limits are at the same time traversed.[65] This supposes a distinction – however much it might be problematized or hybridized – which Unamuno finds to be at odds with true universality. Reception theory takes all things to mean what any given place and time, a specific context, sees in them. The art historian Christopher S. Wood notes that this entails 'the inextricability of a […] text from a present-tense reading situation'. Wood goes on to wonder if such an approach can really account for what makes something classical. He recalls instead Warburg's evocation of something potent transmitted across geography and history.[66] In *En torno*, Unamuno voices a like preoccupation and extends it well beyond the peculiarities of classical antiquity. Things can attain true universality, and when they do so, they bind their originating context to all humanity for future times.

Universality revisited

Many nineteenth-century Spanish subjects longed to be universal. It was a way for a people - fallen from its perch and shoved to the margins - to participate in humanity's grand design. It was a practical action, a staking out of a place in the sun. It was also in some ways simply a fact about their lives: many Spaniards were dedicated to supranational movements and institutions with universal pretensions, or simply to common concerns of humanity. Powerful ideological preoccupations of our time have prevented serious, positive consideration of their efforts. Some such anxieties are well founded: supposed universal judgments often expressed prejudice. But the censure rests on something more – or perhaps, better said, something less – than good moral sense. It arises because, always historicizing, critics see in universalism only local interests dressed in finery. The best one could really hope for, in their eyes, is something that criss-crosses the particular. In a way this is quite right: universalism is their opponent, it is what their opening gambit seeks to deny.

Conversely, efforts to be universal are redolent with rich possibilities beyond their critics' worldview. To be universal was to engage with the particular, bringing forth fundamental sense, feeling, and action through the specific. It was to recognize that we are creatures of value, choice, and judgment, and that these things are also fundamental realities. It was to be a shape-shifter, multiple, fragmenting and reconstituting. It was to accept risk as constitutive of who we are. It was to mutate and experience mutation among endlessly similar entities. It was to embrace poetry at the heart of ourselves, transmigrating, rhythmically swaying through place and time. Above all, it was how particular locations fused with all humanity.

These were powerful proposals for how to be in the nineteenth century. More than that, they are resonant suggestions still of how to express Spain's place – or the place of any peripheral people – in the world.

References

Appiah, Kwame Anthony, *The Ethics of Identity* (Princeton: Princeton UP, 2005)

Artero, Juan de la G., *Atlas de historia universal* (Granada: Imprenta de D.F. de los Reyes, 1896)

Badiou, Alain, *Being and Event* (London: Continuum, 2005)

Baró, Teodoró, *Compendio de historia universal y particular de España, segunda edición* (Barcelona: Librería de Juan y Antonio Bastiños, 1880)

Bhabha, Homi, *The Location of Culture* (London: Routledge, 1994)

Burguera Lopez, Mónica, '"Al Ángel Regio" Respetabilidad femenina y monarquía constitucional en la España posrevolucionaria', in *Culturas políticas monárquicas en la España liberal*, ed. Encarna García Monerris et al. (Valencia: Publicaciones de la Universitat de València, 2013 [digital edition, no pagination])

Calderón, Salvador, and Enrique Serrano, *Total organización de la materia* (Madrid: Imprenta de M. Tello, 1870)

Campoamor, Ramón de, *El drama universal* (Lima: Benito Gil, 1969)

Cannadine, David, *The Undivided Past: History Beyond Our Differences* (London: Penguin, 2013)

Capellán de Miguel, Gonzalo, *La España armónica: El proyecto del krausismo español para una sociedad en conflicto* (Madrid: Biblioteca Nueva, 2006)

Carr, Raymond, *Spain: 1808-1975* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1982)

Carrasco, Juan Bautista, *Mitología universal, historia y esplicación de las ideas religiosas y teológicas de todos los siglos* (Madrid: Imprenta y Librería de Gaspar y Roig, 1865)

Casañ y Alegre, Juan, *Curso elemental razonado de historia universal* (Valencia: Imprenta de J. Domenech, 1871)

Cerdá, Ildefonso, *Teoría general de la urbanización, y aplicación de sus principios y doctrinas a la reforma y ensanche de Barcelona* (Madrid: [n.pub.], 1867)

Constitución política de la Monarquía Española (Valladolid: Editorial Maxtor, 2001)

Cuddy-Keane, Melba, et al, *Modernism: Keywords* (Oxford: Wiley/Blackwell, 2014)

Davis, Stuart, *Writing and Heritage in Contemporary Spain: The Imaginary Museum of Literature* (Woodbridge: Tamesis, 2012)

Delgado, Elena, Jordana Mendelson, and Óscar Vázquez, eds., *Journal of Iberian & Latin American Studies* 13:2-3 (2007): *Recalcitrant Modernities: Spain, Cultural Difference and the Location of Modernism*

Foucault, Michel, *The Order of Things* (London: Taylor & Francis, 2005)

Flitter, Derek, *Spanish Romantic Literary Theory and Criticism* (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1992)

García y Álvarez, Rafael, *Nociones de historia natural* (Granada: Imprenta de D. Francisco

Ventura y Sabatal, 1867)

Garriga Marill, Pedro, *Taquigrafía y su historia universal, cuarta edición* (Madrid: Imprenta de Fortanet, 1879)

Ginger, Andrew, *Liberalismo y romanticismo: La reconstrucción del sujeto histórico* (Madrid: Biblioteca Nueva, 2012)

---, 'The Nineteenth-Century Popular Book as Multiple Media Object', in *Pruebas de imprenta: Estudios sobre la cultura editorial del libro en la España moderna y contemporánea*, ed. Gabriel Sánchez (Madrid: Iberoamericana, 2013), 163-76.

Gómez de Avellaneda, Gertrudis, 'La Mujer', in *Obras literarias de la Señora Gertrudis Gómez de Avellaneda, Tomo V* (Madrid: Imprenta y Estereotipia de M. Rivadeneyra, 1871), 283-306

Haney, David, and Donald Wehrs, *Levinas and Nineteenth-Century Literature: Ethics and Otherness From Romanticism Through Realism* (Cranbury: Associated University Presses, 2009)

Irazábal, Clara, ed., *Transbordering Latin America: Liminal Places, Cultures, and Powers (There)*, (London: Routledge, 2014)

Jameson, Fredric, *The Political Unconscious: Narrative as a Socially Symbolic Act* (New York: Cornell UP, 1981)

Labanyi, Jo, *Gender and Modernization in the Spanish Realist Novel* (Oxford: Oxford UP, 2000)

Laita y Moya, Mariano, *Compendio de historia universal* (Bilbao: Tipografía de Agustín Emperaile, 1887)

Longhurst, Alex, *Unamuno's Theory of the Novel* (London: MHRA/Legenda, 2014)

Madoz, Pascual, *Diccionario geográfico-estadístico-histórico de España y sus posesiones de Ultramar* (Madrid: Imprenta de P. Madoz & L. Sagasti, 1846)

Manning, Susan, *Poetics of Character: Transatlantic Encounters 1700-1900* (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2013)

Martí-López, Elisa, *Borrowed Words: Translation, Imitation, and the Making of the Nineteenth-Century Novel in Spain* (Cranbury: Associated University Presses, 2002)

Mata, Pedro, *Hipócrates y las escuelas hipocráticas: Discurso pronunciado en la solemne apertura de las sesiones del año de 1859 en la Real Academia de Medicina de Madrid por el Doctor Don Pedro Mata socio de número de la misma* (Madrid: Imprenta de Manuel Rojas, 1859)

Méndez Álvaro, Francisco, and Matías Nieto Serrano, *Prontuario universal de ciencias médicas, o sea compendio de todas las materias que abraza la enseñanza médica en las Universidades de España* (Madrid: Imprenta de Vicente de Lalama, 1847)

Mignolo, Walter D., *Local Histories/Global Designs: Coloniality, Subaltern Knowledges, and Border Thinking* (Princeton: Princeton UP, 2012)

Monegal, Antonio, 'A Landscape of Relations: Peninsular Multiculturalism and the Avatars of Comparative Literature', in *Spain Beyond Spain: Modernity, Literary History, and National Identity*, ed. Bradley S. Epps and Luis Fernández Cifuentes (Cranbury: Associated University Presses, 2005), 231-49

Monturiol, Narcisco, *Memoria sobre la navegación submarina por el inventor del Ictíneo o Barco Pez* (Barcelona: Establecimiento Tipográfico de Narciso Ramírez)

Moreno Espinosa, Alfonso, *Cartilla de historia universal para uso de los niños* (Cadiz: Imprenta de la Revista Médica, 1871)

Nieto y Serrano, Matías, *Ensayo de medicina general, o sea de filosofía médica* (Madrid: Imprenta de Manuel de Rojas, 1860)

Nussbaum, Martha, *Cultivating Humanity: A Classical Defence of Reform in Liberal Education* (Harvard UP, 1997)

Ortega y Rubio, Juan, *Compendio de historia universal, tercera edición* (Valladolid: Imprenta de Hijos de J. Pastor, 1862)

Pastor, Brígida, *Fashioning Feminism in Cuba and Beyond: The Prose of Gertrudis Gómez de Avellaneda* (New York: Peter Lang, 2003)

Paterno, Alejandro, *La familia tagálog en la historia universal* (Madrid: Imprenta de los Sucesores de Cuesta, 1892)

Payne, Michael, and John Schad, eds., *Life.after.Theory* (London: Continuum, 2003)

Picón Garfield, Evelyn, *Poder y sexualidad: El discurso de Gertrudis Gómez de Avellaneda* (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 1993)

Pi i Margall, Francisco, *Las nacionalidades* (Madrid: Eduardo Martínez, Sucesor de Escribano, 1877)

Putnam, Hilary, *The Collapse of the Fact/Value Dichotomy and Other Essays* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard UP, 2004)

Puyals de la Bastida, Vicente, *Historia de la numeración con novedades de grande importancia universal* (Madrid: Imprenta de M. Minuesa, 1875)

Sanz del Río, Julián, *C.Cr. Krause, Ideal de la humanidad para la vida* (Madrid: Imprenta de Manuel Galiano, 1860)

Sen, Amartya, *The Idea of Justice* (London: Penguin, 2010)

Serrano y Díez, Nicolás María, *Compendio de historia universal, segunda edición* (Havana: Imprenta de la Correspondencia de Cuba, 1885)

Sinclair, Alison, *Uncovering the Mind: Unamuno, the Unknown, and the Vicissitudes of Self* (Manchester: Manchester UP, 2001)

Stephens, Bradley, *Victor Hugo, Jean-Paul Sartre, and the Liability of Liberty* (London: MHRA, 2011)

Unamuno, Miguel de, *En torno al casticismo*:

https://es.wikisource.org/wiki/En_torno_al_casticismo

Vilaseca, David, *Hindsight and the Real: Subjectivity in Gay Hispanic Autobiography* (Bern: Peter Lang, 2003)

Vertovec, Steven, *Transnationalism* (London: Routledge, 2009)

Wood, Christopher S., 'Envoi: Reception of the Classics', in *Reception of the Classics: An Interdisciplinary Approach to the Classical Tradition*, ed. William Brockliss (Cambridge: CUP, 2012), 163-73

Zavala, Iris, *Unamuno y el pensamiento dialógico* (Barcelona: Anthropos, 1991)

Žižek, Slavoj, *In Defence of Lost Causes* (London: Verso, 2008)

Introduction

Andrew Ginger and Geraldine Lawless

Over the past quarter of a century, the study of nineteenth-century Hispanic culture and society has undergone two major shifts. The first was a rejection of what the economic historian David Ringrose called 'the myth of backwardness': the notion that these cultures and societies were exceptions that trailed behind the wider West.[67] Replacing this myth, there has been a concerted effort to show how Hispanic cultures and societies were integral parts and inflections of the development of the modern world. The second trend – particularly prevalent in cultural and literary study – was a critical focus on a core triad of nation, gender, and representation. The interrelationship of these three was widely seen as defining the discursive and ideological structures of the hegemonic social systems of 'modernity'. These two main tendencies in historiography combined in an understanding that the specific way that Hispanic cultures and societies were integral to the West was the manner in which they participated in the discursive and ideological structures of nation, gender, and representation through which modern social systems constructed themselves. Jo Labanyi's great study, *Gender and Modernization in the Spanish Realist Novel* (2000) crystallized this trend.[68]

These breakthroughs were followed by a sustained expansion of what is studied, and by an equally sustained sophistication of method. There was an impulse to show how such societies related to broader patterns in the West, and this was accompanied by a voracious urge to address perspectives, approaches and theorizations that have proved fruitful in relation to these wider developments. There has been a rediscovered emphasis on imperialism, colonialism, slavery and race as key factors in society and conceptions of nationhood, both in Spain itself and in its dependent territories of the period, especially Cuba and the Philippines.[69] Within Iberia, the combination of nation, gender, and representation has

provided a vehicle through which to understand the fraught dynamism of the relationships between Spain's several nationalities.[70] National narratives on which interpretations of these nationalities rest have been queried, a stance encapsulated in the title of the influential collection of essays *Spain Beyond Spain* (2005).[71] Concerns with gender and related medical-historical approaches have expanded to encompass, inter alia, same-sex relations, hermaphroditism, and so-called 'deviance'.[72] Just as there has been a concern to re-connect nineteenth-century Spain to wider developments, so there has been a preoccupation with the ways in which cross-border and global relationships shaped Spanish culture and society. These range from personal and intellectual connections across the Spanish-speaking Atlantic (and beyond), to the translation and re-working of European novels, to new understandings of networks linking so-called peripheral parts of Europe.[73] It has become clear that some key ways in which Spanish national culture was debated were in fact forged in overtly transnational contexts.[74]

On an empirical level, there has been a much more determined and positive focus on the study of literature, ideas, and culture of the period before the so-called Glorious Revolution (*La Gloriosa*) of 1868-74, so often previously taken to be a watershed in terms of quality of thought and artistry. There has been a renewed engagement with radical leftist thought as much as traditionalist visions;[75] with startling experiments in literature and art in the first two thirds of the century from the writers Rosalía de Castro and Antonio Ros de Olano to the painter Eugenio Lucas;[76] and with whole genres, whether that might be illustrations in magazines, the nude in art, or popular novels concerned with sex;[77] and broad cultural concerns such as the establishment of art collections.[78] Though much remains to be done in creating modern editions, numerous important texts have been republished.[79] In the world of the visual arts, there has been a re-housing of the nineteenth-century collections of the Prado within the extensions to the main building, as well as new catalogues and

exhibitions.[80]

In re-situating nineteenth-century Spain within the wider West, historians of culture, politics, and society have begun to bring out some of the unique features of its inflection of wider developments. Some of these – like bullfighting, or the persistent significance of the Catholic Church and of religious concerns, or the lengthy dependence of this European power on slavery – were, so to speak, hidden in plain sight, but needed to be subject to less mystification and more understanding of the specifics of their historical role on the ground.[81] Others – notably the distinctive aesthetic contributions of Spanish artists and writers mentioned above – required new levels of comparativist study in order to be more fully understood. Often, a shift of perspective has been necessary to bring distinctive factors more fully into view. The institution of monarchy proved both central to the destiny of the country's politics and profoundly compromised by a series of factors, from machinations and anti-Liberal sentiment at Court, to the accession of Isabel II as a child-queen in 1833.[82] A precocious radicalization and politicization of great swathes of the population extending into rural areas occurred due not least to the persistent, related civil war and violence, which at the same time gave power to military leaders within both the Liberal and Absolutist camps.[83] If Spain was surprisingly radical in political terms, and (as of 1834) persistently parliamentary even as it was often praetorian in its dominant political forms, it was also characterized less by a failed attempt at creating a single national identity, than by a plural, energized dynamic of rival conceptions of nationality.[84] At the same time, exile, and thus life in other societies and cultures, became a defining experience for many Spanish intellectuals and writers for much of the century as they fled or were expelled from the country's internal turbulence, often returning at a later date as their individual circumstances changed with the changing times.[85] Meanwhile, the legacy of Islamic and Jewish Spain, and of the transoceanic early-modern Spanish monarchy complicated Spaniards' relationship to the Orient (compared, say,

to that of the French or the British) and meant that ethnic exclusion and inclusion was often framed in terms of a special racial heterogeneity.[86]

The focus of this book

The notion of Spain's relative 'normality' within the West has thus become less a point of contention and novel conclusion and more the starting-point of investigations. And, as research expands, so the growing richness of our understanding of nineteenth-century Spain is stretching beyond the limits of the nation-gender-representation triad. It is becoming important to bring other subjects more directly into view, without losing sight of those established objects of study.

The same may be said of methods of research. At times, the nation-gender-representation triad has rested on very specific accounts of ideology, in which the latter is envisaged as the offshoots of a social system that rests on a foundational principle or principles This has often led to a focus on ideological drives, or, conversely, on resistance to such forces. And, because of the premise that the perpetrators or the victims were unaware of what was driving them or lacked the necessary analytical tools, decisions about what to study risk being directed away from what these people themselves saw as important or significant. There have been some significant countervailing accounts to that trend. Sedgwick has commented on the risk inherent in US critical theory, that 'where Marx, Nietzsche, and Freud by themselves are taken as constituting a pretty sufficient genealogy for the mainstream of New Historicist, deconstructive, feminist, queer, and psychoanalytic criticism, to apply a hermeneutics of suspicion is […] widely understood as a mandatory injunction rather than a possibility among other possibilities'. [87] With more specific reference to Spain, and apropos of cultural studies, Noël Valis in *The Culture of Cursilería* (2002) explains:

> In some versions […] a largely uncontested tenet presumes that historical realities can be invariably organized into monolithic blocks of dominant and marginal groups. The 'dominant elite' appears motivated purely by power and the desire to exclude the marginal, while the marginal seems uniquely characterized as the non-dominant, that is, as an essential (and often essentialized) lack, whose virtue derives from its nondominance. The result is a reductive impoverishment of our critical and historical understanding.[88]

Valis grapples with the relationship between long-term developments and (temporal and geographical) local specificities, and also with those grand narratives that tend to tidy away the leftovers and loose ends of lived experience:

> Either we explain these pieces of varying size as part of the whole, in functionalist terms, so that everything fits the picture and coheres, narratively and otherwise, or, contrary to this organicist model that narrative tends to favor, we declare the existence of contradiction, disjunction, and randomness. One recognizes ruptures within the presumed uniformity and homogenous strength of a culture and the role human agency plays in catalyzing the process of rupture.[89]

In considering Romanticism and its legacy, Valis comes to prize an emphasis on what she calls 'cultural practice'.[90] Within the revived field of biographical study, there has been a related attempt to understand the degree of agency that individuals exert, how they did so, and with what limitations, an approach best exemplified in this field by Isabel Burdiel's account of Queen Isabel II.[91] There is a similar awareness that individuals may be driven, and their lives framed by, concerns other than those of nationality per se, as Fernando Durán has

observed of the religious and critically minded José María Blanco White, a leading Spanish exile in Britain.[92]

This collection of essays provides a strong focus for the exploration and stimulation of substantial new areas of enquiry. The shared concern is with how members of the cultural and intellectual elite in the nineteenth century conceived or undertook major activities that shaped their lives. In that spirit, each chapter title begins with the words 'How to...' and the volume looks at how nineteenth-century Spaniards went about specific tasks. The essays are not confined to any single area of practice, nor do they share a home in social history, biography, or literary criticism, though all these things are here. These essays share three things in varying degrees. First, there is an appreciation of the fact that plurality, contradictions and/or inconsistencies are an inevitable part of lived experience. Second, there is a willingness to let this be. And third, there is a reluctance to rationalize in terms of a conspiracy to oppress. The volume looks at how people did things without necessarily framing questions of motive or incentive in terms that would bring the debate back to a master system of gender, racial, ethnographic or national proportions.

We thereby incorporate, but also break the limitations of, the nation-gender-representation paradigm by inviting researchers to range more freely in identifying what mattered to people in nineteenth-century cultures and societies. It is an inevitable reality of this kind of productive, open invitation, that the series of topics studied could be extended to the study of activities other than those we consider here, to a succession of further *how tos*... In one sense, that is the point: our objective is to broaden further still the scope of scholarship, and not to reduce matters to a closed system. At the same time, within this collection of essays, we present a major series of understudied and fundamentally important topics in nineteenth-century Hispanic Studies. The collection opens with a gaze upon nineteenth-century Spain from the distance of long-term history. From there, we move into

the nineteenth century to survey a series of overarching challenges with which the cultural and intellectual elite wrestled, from how to be universal to how to right wrongs. Then we zoom into roles played by particular groups of people (literary figures, intellectuals, men), before finally focusing our eyes upon one individual life.

Our concern is with cultural practices and with ways of living within a culture and society. We do not exclude the use of the term *cultural practices* as referring to the sociological and ideological manifestations of a social system, as may have been habitual in Hispanic cultural studies under the influence of Bourdieu, for example.[93] However, we emphasize how people's ways of conceiving their lives and their corresponding practices, in and of themselves, are fundamental to giving shape to cultures and societies, rather than being expressions of social systems. We are attentive here to something like what Richard Sennett has recently called 'the craft of experience', the 'techniques' that enable people to make their way through life and to participate.[94] We are not concerned here, however, with presenting an ethical ideal. Adaptability, paradox, and/or logical inconsistency, in varying combinations and emphases come to the fore in many of the essays, not so much because they reveal contradictions in a socio-economic system, as because they are expressions of a human quest for opportunity and survival in a complex and changing world. The nineteenth-century Hispanic world had been shattered to its core by wars, civil wars, and revolutions, at the same time as it confronted a new period of European and North-American expansion and development across numerous spheres of life, from the military to international publishing to industry. We explore here some of the major, dynamic ways in which people sought to adapt and change, or even simply to continue as they were.

Context in these essays means much more than that certain conditions predominated in a given year or decade or even century, or in a particular place. The term is understood here in a much more rich and variegated way. At times, the word *context* itself - suggestive as

it is of a delineated location in time and place with boundaries about it - is more an obstacle than an aid to comprehension, however much it may be qualified or rendered complex. A patchwork of long-term factors and legacies were crucial and persistent in nineteenth-century Spain. So too – and together – were the wider effects of having governed a global empire over centuries, and a burning desire to integrate Spain and its territories into developments that were shaping the wider world. We begin with the long view of state formation out of which nineteenth-century Spain emerged. The state was struggling still with challenges and attempted solutions first confronted in the medieval and early-modern period. It was as much an orphan of its own system of governance over an area stretching from the Atlantic to the Pacific as were its former domains in the Americas (and vice-versa). In this sense, the crises of nineteenth-century Spain were the crises of many centuries and of a vast region of the globe.

Throughout the collection we see how long-term cultural and societal trends, stemming from the medieval and early modern periods, remained significant reference points. This is particularly true of the Catholic Church, and, more broadly of loyalty to Catholic and Christian belief. It is the case too with notions of chivalry, honour, and valour, with long-standing social roles such as that of the *man of letters* (which appears to outweigh the feminine equivalent, *mujer de letras*, by over a thousand to one in usage in the nineteenth-century Spanish press),[95] and with traditions concerning the genders from bearded men to so-called masculine women (*mujeres varoniles*). This is not to say that nothing new was afoot. Manifestly, the collapse of the historic system of monarchy was unprecedented, as was Spain's eclipse by the Great Powers - even by the standards of the previous century. There was an influx from Europe and beyond of innovative ideas, practices, and simply - but just as importantly – fashions and forms of gentility. Over time these included the widespread, explicit circulation of notions hostile to the Faith. Equally, the older practices and ideas

constituted something more, or other than a homogeneous body of traditional doctrine, with definitive dogmatic answers to the problems of humanity and of Spain, and with a common single origin. Much of the longer legacy was one of an ongoing struggle with recurrent problems and objectives, and between contested visions of the Crown or State and Church, as well as of the various component parts of what was called Spain, among many other choices or dilemmas. The legacy of the past was as often as not a ragbag of notions, accumulated over centuries, that was applied or revoked, accepted or rejected, diversely and by turns, as it always had been. The same may be said of the 'new ideas' themselves. Neither the 'old' nor the 'new' need be thought of as categories embodying either philosophical coherence or stemming from a single point in place and time.

Many members of Spain's cultural and intellectual elite were alert to, or at the very least vividly expressed such challenges facing any clear notion of locatedness in a specific place or time. Often, their practices are implicitly suggestive of other ways of imagining the world than those enshrined in the word *context*, or, at a minimum, reveal the multiplicity and variety of relevant things that might simultaneously be thought to constitute *the context*. For example, the historic notion of the man of letters segues into that of the intellectual, and this can be understood in terms of interdependent technological, political, and literary change. Ideas and practices travelled backward and forward across multiple borders and played out on different types of public stage as and when opportunities presented themselves. Not least through the prestige of women authors, literary networks directly joined Spain to other 'peripheral' cultures, as well as supposedly dominant centres like Paris. Some Spanish subjects both in and beyond Spain, openly advocated an altogether different conceptualization of place and time, not merely transnational or transhistorical, but unbounded by narrow notions of locatedness. Writers and artists might, for example, at one and the same time employ a view of history both as cyclical and as continual progress

towards a future, slipping between contrasting or complementary visions. Others explicitly sought out ways in which the specificities of a particular location could be bound to all humanity across the centuries. They explored how things of the past or of other places are living realities beyond the confines of any supposed contextualization. In many cases, Spaniards juggled, wrestled with, or just made use of diverse value systems and terms of reference with quite distinct origins. Variegated sets of terminology overlapped in what Spaniards had to say, and in how they conceived their social roles. The trajectory of the artist Pablo Picasso is an exemplary instance of such phenomena. At the turn of the century, and - we might imagine - on course to be foundational for 'modernism', Picasso's work is fraught with pressures emanating from diverse views of life with conflicting provenances. Not least among these, once more, is that ancient institution: the Catholic Church. Arguably, twentieth-century Spanish culture was born less of an embrace of the new per se, than of the multifaceted experiences of place and time bequeathed to it by the nineteenth; and the nineteenth, in turn, took these experiences from across the ages. The *siglo diecinueve* was much more than of its own time.

Such nineteenth-century ways of doing things are suggestive of a further set of *how tos* with which this collection of essays - like this introductory chapter - deals. Collectively, these might be titled: *how to write about nineteenth-century Spain*. There are three ways in which the various chapters address that concern; on some occasions, a chapter deals primarily with one of these, on others with a combination of them. The first is to write about the nineteenth century in a fashion that gives breathing space to the multifaceted nature of lived experience and practices, the coexistence of diverse conceptions of time, place, and value. Here, style and tone are substance. The second is to set out explicitly a possible way of writing about the nineteenth century. In some instances, this takes the form of a specific overarching approach, such as life-writing, or the tracing of transnational networks of cultural

transmission. In others, it takes shape as a series of emergent questions that researchers might ask themselves, for example about how to explore journalistic texts. The third is to find, in nineteenth-century Spanish culture, practices with which we might experiment when writing now: simultaneous expression of multiple temporalities, for example, or a poetics free of contextualization.

Ways of being in nineteenth-century Spain are thus living sources for historians far beyond Iberia and well after the year 1900.

References

Alonso, Gregorio, *La nación en capilla: Ciudadanía católica y cuestión religiosa en España* (Granada: Editorial Comares, 2014)

Alonso, Gregorio, and Daniel Muñoz Sempere, eds., *Londres y el liberalismo hispánico* (Madrid: Iberoamericana, 2011)

Álvarez Millán, Cristina, and Claudia Heide, eds., *Pascual de Gayangos: A Nineteenth-Century Spanish Arabist* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2008)

Aymes, Jean-René, *Españoles en París en la época romántica* (Madrid: Alianza, 2008)

Blanco, Alda, *Cultura y conciencia imperial en la España del siglo XIX* (Valencia: Publicacions de la Universitat de Valencia, 2012)

Burdiel, Isabel, *Isabel II: No se puede reinar inocentemente* (Madrid: Espasa Calpe, 2004)

---, *Isabel II: Una biografía (1830-1904)* (Madrid: Taurus, 2010)

Charnon-Deutsch, Lou, *Hold That Pose: Visual Culture in the Late Nineteenth-Century Spanish Periodical* (Philadelphia: Penn State UP, 2008)

Cleminson, Richard, and Francisco Vázquez García, *'Los invisibles': A History of Male Homosexuality in Spain, 1850-1940* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2007);

---, *Hermaphroditism, Medical Science and Sexual Identity in Spain, 1850-1960* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2007)

Durán, Fernando, *José María Blanco White; o, La conciencia errante* (Seville: Fundación José Manuel Lara, 2005)

Epps, Brad, and Luis Fernández Cifuentes, eds., *Spain Beyond Spain: Modernity, Literary History and National Identity* (Lewisburg: Bucknell UP, 2005)

Fernández, Pura, *Mujer pública y vida privada: Del arte eunuco a la novela lupanaria* (Woodbridge: Tamesis, 2008)

Fernández Pura, and Marie-Linda Ortega, eds., *La mujer de letras o la letraherida: Discursos y representaciones sobre la mujer escritora en el siglo XIX* (Madrid: CSIC, 2008)

Flitter, Derek, *Spanish Romanticism and the Use of History: Ideology and the Historical Imagination* (Oxford: Legenda, 2006)

Ginger, Andrew, *Liberalismo y romanticismo: La reconstrucción del sujeto histórico* (Madrid: Biblioteca Nueva, 2012)

---, *Painting and the Turn to Cultural Modernity in Spain: The Time of Eugenio Lucas Velázquez* (Cranbury, N.J.: Associated UP, 2007)

Goode, Joshua, *Impurity of Blood: Defining Race in Spain, 1870-1930* (Louisiana: Louisiana State UP, 2009)

Kamen, Henry, *The Disinherited: The Exiles Who Created Spanish Culture* (London: Penguin, 2007)Barón, Javier, and José Luis Díez, eds., *El Siglo XIX en el Prado*, (Madrid: Museo Nacional del Prado, 2007)

Kosofsky Sedgwick, Eve, 'Paranoid Reading and Reparative Reading; or, You're So Paranoid, You Probably Think This Introduction Is About You', in *Novel Gazing: Queer Readings in Fiction*, ed. Eve Kosofsky Sedgwick (Durham: Duke UP, 1997), 1-37

Labanyi, Jo, *Gender and Modernization in the Spanish Realist Novel* (Oxford: Oxford UP, 2000)

Lawless, Geraldine, *Modernity's Metonyms: Figuring Time in Nineteenth-Century Spanish Stories* (Lewisburg: Bucknell UP, 2011)

Lawrence, Mark, *Spain's First Carlist War, 1833-40* (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014)

Martí-López, Elisa, *Borrowed Words: Translation, Imitation, and The Making of The Nineteenth-Century Novel in Spain* (Lewisburg: Bucknell UP, 2002)

Martín-Márquez, Susan, *Disorientations: Spanish Colonialism in Africa and the Performance of Identity* (New Haven: Yale UP, 2008)

Miguélez-Carballeira, Helena, *Galicia, A Sentimental Nation* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2013)

Mora, José Joaquín de, *Leyendas españolas*, ed. Salvador García Castañeda and Alberto Romero Ferrer (Cádiz: University of Cádiz Press, 2013)

Partzsch, Henriette, 'The Complex Routes of Travelling Texts: Fredrika Bremer's Reception in Nineteenth-Century Spain and the Transnational Dimension of Literary History', *Comparative Critical Studies* 11, nos. 2-3 (2014), 281-93

Pérez Ledesma, Manuel, ed., *Trayectorias transatlánticas (Siglo XIX): Personajes y redes entre España y América* (Madrid: Ediciones Polifemo, 2013)

Peyrou, Florencia, *El republicanismo popular en España, 1840-1843* (Cádiz: University of Cádiz Press, 2002);

Reyero, Carlos, *Desvestidas: El cuerpo y la forma real* (Madrid: Alianza, 2009)

Ringrose, David, *España, 1700-1900: El mito del fracaso* (Madrid: Alianza, 1996)

Ros de Olano, Antonio, *Relatos*, ed. Jaume Pont (Barcelona: Crítica, 2008)

Schmidt-Nowara, Christopher, *The Conquest of History: Spanish Colonialism and National Histories in the Nineteenth Century* (Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 2006)

Shubert, Adrian, *Death and Money in The Afternoon: A History of The Spanish Bullfight* (Oxford: Oxford UP, 1999)

Julian Smith, Paul, *The Moderns: Time, Space, and Subjectivity in Contemporary Spanish Culture* (Oxford: Oxford UP, 2000)

Sennett, Richard, *The Craftsman* (London: Penguin, 2008)

Surwillo, Lisa, *Monsters by Trade: Slave Traffickers in Modern Spanish Literature and Culture* (Stanford: Stanford UP, 2014)

Thomson, Guy, *The Birth of Modern Politics in Spain: Democracy, Association and Revolution, 1854-75* (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010)

Torres-Pau, Joan, *Asia en la España del siglo XIX. Literatos, viajeros, intelectuales y diplomáticos ante Oriente* (Rodopi: Amsterdam-New York, 2013)

Tsuchiya, Akiko, *Marginal Subjects: Gender and Deviance in Fin-de-siècle Spain* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2011)

Tully, Carol, *Johann Nicolas Bohl von Faber (1770-1836): A German Romantic in Spain* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2008)

Valis, Noël, *The Culture of Cursilería: Bad Taste, Kitsch, and Class in Modern Spain* (Durham: Duke UP, 2002)

Vázquez, Oscar E., *Inventing the Art Collection: Patrons, Markets, and the State in Nineteenth-Century Spain* (Philadelphia: Pennsylvania UP, 2001)

1 Michel Foucault, *The Order of Things* (London: Taylor & Francis, 2005), 422.

2 Homi Bhabha, *The Location of Culture* (London: Routledge, 1994), 247, 249.

3 For a clear statement of such suspicions, see Walter D. Mignolo, *Local Histories/Global Designs: Coloniality, Subaltern Knowledges, and Border Thinking* (Princeton: Princeton UP, 2012), x-xi.

4 Stuart Davis, *Writing and Heritage in Contemporary Spain: The Imaginary Museum of Literature* (Woodbridge: Tamesis, 2012), 114 [citing Duncan and Wallach].

5 Antonio Monegal, 'A Landscape of Relations: Peninsular Multiculturalism and the Avatars of Comparative Literature', in *Spain Beyond Spain: Modernity, Literary History, and National Identity*, ed. Bradley S. Epps and Luis Fernández Cifuentes (Cranbury: Associated University Presses, 2005), 246.

6. Slavoy Žižek, *In Defence of Lost Causes* (London: Verso, 2008), 179-81, 413-5; Alain Badiou, *Being and Event* (London: Continuum, 2005), 338-43; David Vilaseca, *Hindsight and the Real: Subjectivity in Gay Hispanic Autobiography* (Bern: Peter Lang, 2003), 19-25; Mignolo, *Local Histories/Global Designs*, 310.

7 Donald Wehrs and David Haney, *Levinas and Nineteenth-Century Literature: Ethics and Otherness From Romanticism Through Realism* (Cranbury: Associated University Presses, 2009), 24.

8 Bradley Stephens, *Victor Hugo, Jean-Paul Sartre, and the Liability of Liberty* (London: MHRA, 2011), 10-2 (the quotation is on page 12).

9 For a more sceptical take on Levinas, see Christopher Norris's remarks in *Life.after.Theory*, ed. Michael Payne and John Schad (London: Continuum, 2003), 129.

10 This is true of a whole range of very different interpretations of the century: Derek Flitter, *Spanish Romantic Literary Theory and Criticism* (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1992);

Jo Labanyi, *Gender and Modernization in the Spanish Realist Novel* (Oxford: Oxford UP, 2000); Andrew Ginger, *Liberalismo y romanticismo: La reconstrucción del sujeto histórico* (Madrid: Biblioteca Nueva, 2012).

11 Elisa Martí-López, *Borrowed Words: Translation, Imitation, and the Making of the Nineteenth-Century Novel in Spain* (Cranbury: Associated University Presses, 2002). See also the special issue of *Journal of Iberian & Latin American Studies* 13:2-3 (2007): *Recalcitrant Modernities: Spain, Cultural Difference and the Location of Modernism*, ed. Elena Delgado, Jordana Mendelson, and Óscar Vázquez.

12 For example, Susan Manning, *Poetics of Character: Transatlantic Encounters 1700-1900* (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2013), xi-xii.

13 Martha Nussbaum, *Cultivating Humanity: A Classical Defence of Reform in Liberal Education* (Harvard UP, 1997), 67.

14 David Cannadine, *The Undivided Past: History Beyond Our Differences* (London: Penguin, 2013), Kindle edition, loc. 4716.

15 The title of a recent, major study of Krausism in Spain underlines how the emphasis tends to stray to nation building even where general philosophical ambitions are carefully considered: Gonzalo Capellán de Miguel, *La España armónica: El proyecto del krausismo español para una sociedad en conflicto* (Madrid: Biblioteca Nueva, 2006).

16 Julián Sanz del Río, *C.Cr. Krause, Ideal de la humanidad para la vida* (Madrid: Imprenta de Manuel Galiano, 1860), 3,12.

17 *El Museo Universal*, Year I, no. 1, 15 January 1857, 1-2.

18 Francisco Pi i Margall, *Las nacionalidades* (Madrid: Eduardo Martínez, Sucesor de Escribano, 1877), 247.

19 Pi i Margall, *Las nacionalidades*, 114.

20 Pedro Alejandro Paterno, *La familia tagálog en la historia universal* (Madrid:

Imprenta de los Sucesores de Cuesta, 1892), 61-81.

21 Vicente Puyals de la Bastida, *Historia de la numeración con novedades de grande importancia universal* (Madrid: Imprenta de M. Minuesa, 1875), 12-4.

22 Amartya Sen, *The Idea of Justice* (London: Penguin, 2010), xiii-xv.

23 Nicolás María Serrano y Díez, *Compendio de historia universal, segunda edición* (Havana: Imprenta de la Correspondencia de Cuba, 1885), 17.

24 Juan Ortega y Rubio, *Compendio de historia universal, tercera edición* (Valladolid: Imprenta de Hijos de J. Pastor, 1862) (Prólogo a la primera edición, unpaginated).

25 See Raymond Carr, *Spain: 1808-1975* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1982), 196-7, 202-4, 244, 255.

26 Francisco Méndez Álvaro and Matías Nieto Serrano, *Prontuario universal de ciencias médicas, o sea compendio de todas las materias que abraza la enseñanza médica en las Universidades de España* (Madrid: Imprenta de Vicente de Lalama, 1847) [this is the first volume issued].

27 Ildefonso Cerdá, *Teoría general de la urbanización, y aplicación de sus principios y doctrinas a la reforma y ensanche de Barcelona* (Madrid: [n.pub.], 1867), I: 39, 41.

28 Pascual Madoz *Diccionario geográfico-estadístico-histórico de España y sus posesiones de Ultramar* (Madrid: Imprenta de P. Madoz & L. Sagasti, 1846), xi.

29 *Constitución política de la Monarquía Española* (Valladolid: Editorial Maxtor, 2001), 85, 45.

30 Pedro Mata, *Hipócrates y las escuelas hipocráticas: Discurso pronunciado en la solemne apertura de las sesiones del año de 1859 en la Real Academia de Medicina de Madrid por el Doctor Don Pedro Mata socio de número de la misma* (Madrid: Imprenta de Manuel Rojas, 1859), 7, 26.

31 Alejandro Paterno, *La familia tagálog en la historia universal* (Madrid: Imprenta

de los Sucesores de Cuesta, 1892), 138.

32 Narcisco Monturiol, *Memoria sobre la navegación submarina por el inventor del Ictíneo o Barco Pez* (Barcelona: Establecimiento Tipográfico de Narciso Ramírez), 53.

33 Miguel de Unamuno, *En torno al casticismo*: https://es.wikisource.org/wiki/En_torno_al_casticismo, sections LXXIV.i; LXXVIII (accessed 28 November 2014). I use the online digital resource as it reproduces the original text from the periodical press of 1895. The text appeared in five sections over several months in *La España Moderna*: LXXIV (February, 1895), 17-40; LXXV (March, 1895), 57-82; LXXVI (April, 1895), 27-58; LXXVII (May, 1895), 29-52; LXXVIII (June, 1895), 26-45.

34 Kwame Anthony Appiah *The Ethics of Identity* (Princeton: Princeton UP, 2005), 256**.**

35 Pi i Margall, *Las nacionalidades*, 15, 88-9, 118, 294.

36 On Avellaneda's feminism, see, for example, Brígida Pastor, *Fashioning Feminism in Cuba and Beyond: The Prose of Gertrudis Gómez de Avellaneda* (New York: Peter Lang, 2003). For a clear account of Avellaneda's arguments, see Evelyn Picón Garfield, *Poder y sexualidad: El discurso de Gertrudis Gómez de Avellaneda* (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 1993), 41-4. For a more recent account of Avellaneda's criticism of the political status of women within the Spanish liberal regime, and her assertion of their capacity to govern within the context of contemporaneous debates, see: Mónica Burguera Lopez, '"Al Ángel Regio" Respetabilidad femenina y monarquía constitucional en la España posrevolucionaria', in *Culturas políticas monárquicas en la España liberal*, ed. Encarna García Monerris et al. (Valencia: Publicaciones de la Universitat de València, 2013 [digital edition, no pagination]). There is a growing bibliography on the writer; the focus in this present chapter is solely on her mode of argument in relation to universalisms.

37 Gertrudis Gómez de Avellaneda, 'La Mujer', in *Obras literarias de la Señora*

Gertrudis Gómez de Avellaneda, Tomo V (Madrid: Imprenta y Estereotipia de M. Rivadeneyra, 1871), 283-306.

38 Melba Cuddy-Keane et al, *Modernism: Keywords* (Oxford: Wiley/Blackwell, 2014), 231.

39 Sanz del Río, *Ideal de la humanidad*, 12.

40 Matías Nieto y Serrano, *Ensayo de medicina general, o sea de filosofía médica* (Madrid: Imprenta de Manuel de Rojas, 1860), 13.

41 Alfonso Moreno Espinosa, *Cartilla de historia universal para uso de los niños* (Cadiz: Imprenta de la Revista Médica, 1871), 4.

42 Ortega y Rubio, *Compendio de historia universal*, 12.

43 Ortega y Rubio, *Compendio de historia universal*, 7-11.

44 Pedro Garriga Marill, *Taquigrafía y su historia universal, cuarta edición* (Madrid: Imprenta de Fortanet, 1879), 9-10.

45 Juan Bautista Carrasco, *Mitología universal, historia y esplicación de las ideas religiosas y teológicas de todos los siglos* (Madrid: Imprenta y Librería de Gaspar y Roig, 1865), 3-33.

46 *El Museo Universal*, Year I, No. I, 15 January, 1857, 1-2

47 Moreno Espinosa, *Cartilla de historia universal para uso de los niños*, 3.

48 Ortega y Rubio, *Compendio de historia universal*, 15.

49 Mariano Laita y Moya *Compendio de historia universal* (Bilbao: Tipografía de Agustín Emperaile, 1887), 5.

50 Hilary Putnam, *The Collapse of the Fact/Value Dichotomy and Other Essays* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard UP, 2004), 113. For an example of facts as values in nineteenth-century Spanish literature, see Andrew Ginger, 'The Nineteenth-Century Popular Book as Multiple Media Object', in *Pruebas de imprenta: Estudios sobre la cultura editorial del libro*

en la España moderna y contemporánea, ed. Gabriel Sánchez (Madrid: Iberoamericana, 2013), 163-76.

51 Juan de la G. Artero, *Atlas de historia universal* (Granada: Imprenta de D.F. de los Reyes, 1896).

52 Teodoró Baró, *Compendio de historia universal y particular de España, segunda edición* (Barcelona: Librería de Juan y Antonio Bastiños, 1880), 201-3.

53 Juan Casañ y Alegre, *Curso elemental razonado de historia universal* (Valencia: Imprenta de J. Domenech, 1871), x.

54 Serrano y Díez, *Compendio de historia universal*, 11.

55 Paterno, *La familia tagálog*, 23-7.

56 Rafael García y Álvarez *Nociones de historia natural* (Granada: Imprenta de D. Francisco Ventura y Sabatal, 1867), 208.

57 Enrique Serrano and Salvador Calderón, *Total organización de la materia* (Madrid: Imprenta de M. Tello, 1870), 54.

58 Ramón de Campoamor, *El drama universal* (Lima: Benito Gil, 1969), 39.

59 For a recent revisiting of the role of analogy and rhetoric in our comprehension of (literary) history, drawing inspiration from nineteenth- and eighteenth-century culture see: Manning, *Poetics of Character: Transatlantic Encounters, 1700-1900*, xii-xiii.

60 Alex Longhurst, *Unamuno's Theory of the Novel* (London: MHRA/Legenda, 2014), 76.

61 Iris Zavala has spoken of how Unamuno's texts playfully recodify a whole cultural universe into a chorus of diverse voices: *Unamuno y el pensamiento dialógico* (Barcelona: Anthropos, 1991), 60-1.

62 Alison Sinclair echoes many critics when she comments on Unamuno's love of the creative force of contradiction and his resistance to categorisation in *Uncovering the Mind:*

Unamuno, the Unknown, and the Vicissitudes of Self (Manchester: Manchester UP, 2001), 13-4, 227.

63 Alex Longhurst remarks on Unamuno's hostility to 'academic criticism' and his preference for 'creative engagement'. See *Unamuno's Theory of the Novel*, 201. He similarly notes how Unamuno closes the distinction between poet and philosopher, 150-1.

64 Fredric Jameson, *The Political Unconscious: Narrative as a Socially Symbolic Act* (New York: Cornell UP, 1981), 9.

65 Steven Vertovec points to this dual character of socio-cultural transnationalism in *Transnationalism* (London: Routledge, 2009), 52-3 (see also his comments on the experience of life 'here' and 'there' among migrants 67-8). In an example of the slippage in the use of the term *transnational*, Vertovec at one point considers universalism as one of its possible outcomes (155). There is a useful discussion of the term's definition in *Transbordering Latin America: Liminal Places, Cultures, and Powers (There)*, ed. Clara Irazábal (London: Routledge, 2014), 2-4.

66 Christopher S. Wood, 'Envoi: Reception of the Classics', in *Reception of the Classics: An Interdisciplinary Approach to the Classical Tradition*, ed. William Brockliss (Cambridge: CUP, 2012), 163-73 (163, 171-2).

67 David Ringrose, *España, 1700-1900: El mito del fracaso* (Madrid: Alianza, 1996).

68 Jo Labanyi, *Gender and Modernization in the Spanish Realist Novel* (Oxford: Oxford UP, 2000).

69 For example: Christopher Schmidt-Nowara, *The Conquest of History: Spanish Colonialism and National Histories in the Nineteenth Century* (Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 2006); Alda Blanco, *Cultura y conciencia imperial en la España del siglo XIX* (Valencia: Publicacions de la Universitat de Valencia, 2012).

70 For example: Helena Miguélez-Carballeira, *Galicia, A Sentimental Nation* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2013).

71 Brad Epps and Luis Fernández Cifuentes, eds., *Spain Beyond Spain: Modernity, Literary History and National Identity* (Lewisburg: Bucknell UP, 2005).

72 For example: Richard Cleminson and Francisco Vázquez García, *'Los invisibles': A History of Male Homosexuality in Spain, 1850-1940* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2007); idem, *Hermaphroditism, Medical Science and Sexual Identity in Spain, 1850-1960* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2007); Akiko Tsuchiya, *Marginal Subjects: Gender and Deviance in Fin-de-siècle Spain* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2011).

73 For example: Manuel Pérez Ledesma, ed., *Trayectorias transatlánticas (Siglo XIX): Personajes y redes entre España y América* (Madrid: Ediciones Polifemo, 2013); Elisa Martí-López, *Borrowed Words: Translation, Imitation, and The Making of The Nineteenth-Century Novel in Spain* (Lewisburg: Bucknell UP, 2002); Henriette Partzsch, 'The Complex Routes of Travelling Texts: Fredrika Bremer's Reception in Nineteenth-Century Spain and the Transnational Dimension of Literary History', *Comparative Critical Studies* 11, nos. 2-3 (2014), 281-93.

74 Notably: Carol Tully, *Johann Nicolas Bohl von Faber (1770-1836): A German Romantic in Spain* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2008).

75 For example: Andrew Ginger, *Liberalismo y romanticismo: La reconstrucción del sujeto histórico* (Madrid: Biblioteca Nueva, 2012); Florencia Peyrou, *El republicanismo popular en España, 1840-1843* (Cádiz: University of Cádiz Press, 2002); Derek Flitter, *Spanish Romanticism and the Use of History: Ideology and the Historical Imagination* (Oxford: Legenda, 2006).

76 For example: Geraldine Lawless, *Modernity's Metonyms: Figuring Time in Nineteenth-Century Spanish Stories* (Lewisburg: Bucknell UP, 2011); Andrew Ginger, *Painting and the Turn to Cultural Modernity in Spain: The Time of Eugenio Lucas Velázquez* (Cranbury, N.J.: Associated UP, 2007).

77 For example: Lou Charnon-Deutsch, *Hold That Pose: Visual Culture in the Late Nineteenth-Century Spanish Periodical* (Philadelphia: Penn State UP, 2008); Carlos Reyero, *Desvestidas: El cuerpo y la forma real* (Madrid: Alianza, 2009); Pura Fernández, *Mujer pública y vida privada: Del arte eunuco a la novela lupanaria* (Woodbridge: Tamesis, 2008).

78 Oscar E. Vázquez, *Inventing the Art Collection: Patrons, Markets, and the State in Nineteenth-Century Spain* (Philadelphia: Pennsylvania UP, 2001).

79 Among many examples: Antonio Ros de Olano, *Relatos*, ed. Jaume Pont (Barcelona: Crítica, 2008); José Joaquín de Mora, *Leyendas españolas*, ed. Salvador García Castañeda and Alberto Romero

Ferrer (Cádiz: University of Cádiz Press, 2013).

80 These include the monumental catalogue *El Siglo XIX en el Prado*, ed. José Luis Díez and Javier Barón (Madrid: Museo Nacional del Prado, 2007).

81 For example: Adrian Shubert, *Death and Money in The Afternoon: A History of The Spanish Bullfight* (Oxford: Oxford UP, 1999); Gregorio Alonso, *La nación en capilla: Ciudadanía católica y cuestión religiosa en España* (Granada: Editorial Comares, 2014); Lisa Surwillo, *Monsters by Trade: Slave Traffickers in Modern Spanish Literature and Culture* (Stanford: Stanford UP, 2014).

82 Isabel Burdiel, *Isabel II: No se puede reinar inocentemente* (Madrid: Espasa Calpe, 2004).

83 For example: Mark Lawrence, *Spain's First Carlist War, 1833-40* (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014); Guy Thomson, *The Birth of Modern Politics in Spain: Democracy, Association and Revolution, 1854-75* (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010). Thomson uses the phrase 'precocious politicisation' (4).

84 Ginger, *Liberalismo y romanticismo*.

85 For example: Gregorio Alonso and Daniel Muñoz Sempere, eds., *Londres y el liberalismo hispánico* (Madrid: Iberoamericana, 2011); Jean-René Aymes, *Españoles en París en la época romántica* (Madrid: Alianza, 2008); Henry Kamen, *The Disinherited: The Exiles Who Created Spanish Culture* (London: Penguin, 2007).

86 For example: Susan Martín-Márquez, *Disorientations: Spanish Colonialism in Africa and the Performance of Identity* (New Haven: Yale UP, 2008); Cristina Álvarez Millán and Claudia Heide, eds., *Pascual de Gayangos: A Nineteenth-Century Spanish Arabist* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2008); Joshua Goode, *Impurity of Blood: Defining Race in Spain, 1870-1930* (Louisiana: Louisiana State UP, 2009); Joan Torres-Pau, *Asia en la España del siglo XIX. Literatos, viajeros, intelectuales y diplomáticos ante Oriente* (Rodopi: Amsterdam-New York, 2013).

87 Eve Kosofsky Sedgwick, 'Paranoid Reading and Reparative Reading; or, You're So Paranoid, You Probably Think This Introduction Is About You', in *Novel Gazing: Queer Readings in Fiction*, ed. Eve Kosofsky Sedgwick (Durham: Duke UP, 1997), 1-37 (the quotation is from page 5).

88 Noël Valis, *The Culture of Cursilería: Bad Taste, Kitsch, and Class in Modern Spain* (Durham: Duke UP, 2002), 118.

89 Valis, *The Culture of Cursilería*, 281.

90 Valis, *The Culture of Cursilería*, 119.

91 Isabel Burdiel, *Isabel II: Una biografía (1830-1904)* (Madrid: Taurus, 2010).

92 Fernando Durán, *José María Blanco White; o, La conciencia errante* (Seville: Fundación José Manuel Lara, 2005).

93 A particularly influential use of Bourdieu was Paul Julian Smith, *The Moderns: Time, Space, and Subjectivity in Contemporary Spanish Culture* (Oxford: Oxford UP, 2000).

94 Richard Sennett, *The Craftsman* (London: Penguin, 2008), 289-90.

[95] A ratio of 1577: 1 was obtained by a search of the two terms in the digitized copies of Spanish periodicals in the Biblioteca Nacional Hemeroteca Digital. Google Ngrams for 1800-1899 on the corpus of texts in Spanish show a similarly vast divide, as happens with parallel terms (such as *literato* or *literata* as nouns). On the history of nineteenth-century Spanish struggles over efforts to construct female alternatives to the phrase 'hombre de letras', see *La mujer de letras o la letraherida: Discursos y representaciones sobre la mujer escritora en el siglo XIX*, ed. Pura Fernández and Marie-Linda Ortega (Madrid: CSIC, 2008), 17-32.